

---

**Concerning Identities:**

**For Things, but not the easy Things**

**[Contains Hubs Part I]**



---

# More questions than answers

How do you generate identity?

Is it possible to capture the rules? Is it possible to develop a shared concept of identity for Things? If so, how can we share that concept across institutions?

Less abstractly:

How can we confidently assert that our Hub is the same as a SHARE VDE SuperWork?

How can we confidently assert that our BF Work is the same as Stanford's?

---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

## “Easy” Things

Catalyst for this work was reduction of Anonymous Resources (a.k.a. blank nodes) in preparation of publishing (converted) dataset.

Examples of “easy” Things:

Providers

Roles

Relationships

Extracted from MARC 260, 7XX\$e, 7XX\$i, respectively.

---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

The “Easy” Things relied on simple string matching.

700 1#\$aSmith, John,\$d1900-1945,\$eprincipal investigator.

```
<http://id.loc.gov/entities/roles/principalinvestigator> a madsrdf:Authority ;  
  madsrdf:authoritativeLabel "Principal investigator" ;  
  madsrdf:hasVariant [  
    a madsrdf:Variant ;  
    madsrdf:variantLabel "principal investigator."  
  ] .
```

---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

The “Easy” Things relied on simple string matching.

260 ##\$aParis :\$bGauthier-Villars,\$c1955.

```
<http://id.loc.gov/entities/providers/6adb861ddbe699cb8fd4b5aaa2882108>  
  a madsrdf:Authority, madsrdf:CorporateName ;  
  madsrdf:authoritativeLabel "Gauthier-Villars" .
```

---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

The “Easy” Things relied on simple string matching.

260 ##\$aParis :\$bGauthier-Villars,\$c1955.

```
<http://id.loc.gov/entities/providers/6adb861ddbe699cb8fd4b5aaa2882108>  
  a madsrdf:Authority, madsrdf:CorporateName ;  
  madsrdf:authoritativeLabel "Gauthier-Villars" .
```

Normalization:

gauthiervillars -> [6adb861ddbe699cb8fd4b5aaa2882108](http://id.loc.gov/entities/providers/6adb861ddbe699cb8fd4b5aaa2882108)

---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

## Gauthier-Villars

### URI(s)

- <http://id.loc.gov/entities/providers/6adb861ddbe699cb8fd4b5aaa2882108>

### Instance Of

- MADS/RDF CorporateName
- MADS/RDF Authority
- SKOS Concept [↗](#)

### Scheme Membership(s)

- Providers

### Collection Membership(s)

- Entities Providers
- Entities Publishers

### Variants

- Gauthier-Villars
- Gauthier-Villars [etc.]
- Gauthier-Villars.
- Gauthier-Villars; [etc., etc.]
- Gauthier Villars

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

## Variants

- quthor.
- author.
- authhor.
- aithor.
- authoe.
- auathor.
- auhor.
- aurhor.
- euthor.
- Autor.
- autor
- Autor
- uathor.
- auth.
- auhtor.
- athor.
- autor.
- auther
- aauthor.
- a uthor.
- atuhor.
- aut.
- auhtor
- authpor.
- auther.

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

## Variants

- Container of (work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of
- Container of (work)
- Container of (expression)
- Container of (expression)
- container of (work)
- Container of
- Container of (expression)
- Container of [work]
- Containers of (work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (expression)
- Container of (item)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (manifestation)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (Expression)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (expression)
- Container of (Work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (expression)
- (Container of (work)
- Container of (work)
- Container of (expression)
- container of (work)
- container of (expression)



---

# Providers, Roles, Relationships

## Container of

### URI(s)

- <http://id.loc.gov/entities/relationships/containerof>

### Instance Of

- MADS/RDF Authority
- SKOS Concept [↗](#)
- BF Relation

### Scheme Membership(s)

- Relationships

### Collection Membership(s)

- Entities Relationships

### Variants

- Co ntainer of (work)
- Container of(work)

---

# Agents, Hubs, Works, Instances

## Not so easy Things

Agents (People, Organizations)

Hubs

Works

Instances

Hubs, Works, Instances:

Contributors?

Dates?

Form?

Subjects

And so on...

---

# Hubs

Pursued because we realized we were trying to do too much with bf:Work.

Pursued because we realized we had no good solution for Title/NameTitle access points.

Pursued because aforementioned Title/NameTitle access points were all blank nodes.

Pursued because of engagement with SHARE-VDE and Casalini and the concept of SuperWork.

---

# Hubs

MARC sources for Hubs says a lot about their composition.

Derived from:

MARC Auth 1XX with \$t

MARC Auth 130

MARC Bib 1XX + 240

MARC Bib 130

MARC Bib 600, 610, 611 + \$t; 630 (if \$v, \$x, \$y, or \$z **not** present)

MARC Bib 700, 710, 711 + \$t; 730

---

# Hubs

At most:

- \*Contributor (Only 1)
- \*Title
- Language
- Date
- Key
- Part Number / Section of Work
- Medium of performance for music
- Arranged statement for music
- Version

\* = always

---

# Hubs

No:

Notes

Subjects

Content type

Material type

---

# Hubs

## Bibframe Hub

### Title

Pippi Långstrump

### Type

<http://id.loc.gov/ontologies/bflc/Hub>

### Contribution

Lindgren, Astrid, 1907-2002 Contributor

---

# Hubs

## Bibframe Hub

### Title

Pippi Långstrump. English  
Pippi Longstocking

### Type

<http://id.loc.gov/ontologies/bflc/Hub>

### Contribution

[Lindgren, Astrid, 1907-2002 Contributor](#)

### Language

[English](#)

---

# Hubs

## Bibframe Hub

### Title

Symphonies, no. 9, op. 125, D minor  
Symphonies, no. 9, op. 125, D minor. 1987

### Type

<http://id.loc.gov/ontologies/bflc/Hub>

### Contribution

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827 Contributor

### Creation Date

1987

# Hubs

## Bibframe Hub

### Title

Trios, violin, viola, cello, op. 9. No. 2  
Trios, strings, op. 9. No. 2

### Type

<http://id.loc.gov/ontologies/bflic/Hub>

### Contribution

[Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827 Contributor](#)

### Authorized Access Point

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827 Trios, violin, viola, cello, op. 9. No. 2

### Authorized Access Point Variant

Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827 Trios, strings, op. 9. No. 2

### Admin Metadata

**Creation Date:** 2019-05-20T16:28:32.810288-04:00

**Note:** Data source LCCNs: no 96045248 ; 2006651462; 2017575027; 96706981; 98708797; 99385213; 2005700427

### Part Of

[Mills, Jesse. \[Marlboro Music Festival, 2002-08-16\]](#)

[Dehmel, Richard, 1863-1920. \[Marlboro Music Festival rehearsals, 2002-08-15 and 2002-08-16\]](#)

[Primrose, William, 1904-1982. Jascha Heifetz, the complete stereo collection remastered](#)

[Ohtsu, Junko. \[Library of Congress Music Division concert, 1987-06-09\]](#)

[Trio Pasquier. \[Library of Congress Music Division concert, 1967-12-01\]](#)

[Trio Pasquier. \[Library of Congress Music Division concert, 1959-02-20\]](#)

[Kondonassis, Yolanda. \[Marlboro Music Festival, 1986-07-26\]](#)

### Has Expression

[Beethoven, Ludwig van, 1770-1827 Trios, violin, viola, cello, op. 9. No. 2](#)

---

# Hubs

Dirty little secret:

System operates on the constructed string.

**\$a**Beethoven, Ludwig van, **\$d**1770-1827. **\$t**Trios, **\$m**violin, viola, cello, **\$nop**. 9. **\$n**No. 2

beethovenludwigvan17701827triosviolinviolacello9no2

<http://id.loc.gov/entities/hubs/c5b3ffea51920f5c02fdd1bcc2d4004e>

---

# Hubs

Quite simply, catalogers had created identity by creating a unique Name/Title combination. I didn't need to do more.

But this is – or should be – a temporary condition.

Cannot rely on catalogers continuing this practice.

Hubs, Works, Instances, like Agents (e.g.), are more nuanced.

Which leads to the question....

---

# Hubs

What attributes of a Hub or Work or Instance establish identity?

Do we need to – as a community – develop a common understanding about what ingredients generate identity?

Would this help with exchange of BF resources?

Is it all unnecessary?

Is it too hard and it'll all work out in the long and I'm worrying over nothing?

---

Thank You

<http://id.loc.gov/>

---

# Hubs

The numbers:

2.3M total

1.4M come from MARC Authority Title/NameTitle records

.9M come from MARC Bib records (not in 1.4M from Auths)